

Appendix A - Key Considerations and Evaluation Measures

<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; align-items: center;"> <div style="width: 25%;"> <p> Most preferred</p> <p> Slightly preferred or needs further review</p> <p> Least preferred</p> </div> <div style="width: 70%; text-align: center;"> <p>BADGER STATE TRAIL STEWART TUNNEL KEY CONSIDERATIONS AND EVALUATION MEASURES</p> </div> </div>										
Category*	Evaluation Measure	Alternative 1** Portal Doors \$140,000	Alternative 2*** Rock Netting with Portal Doors \$880,000 plus \$140,000 \$1,020,000 Total	Alternative 3*** Steel Framing/ Scaffolding with Roof and Portal Doors \$4,080,000 plus \$140,000 \$4,220,000 Total	Alternative 4 Corrugated Metal Pipe Tunnel Reline with Bat entry \$3,480,000	Alternative 5 Cast-in-Place Concrete Tunnel Lining \$9,200,000	Alternative 6 Reroute Trail Along Existing Roads \$1,340,000 (Tunnel Rd.) or \$2,010,000 (CTH CC)	Alternative 7 Reroute Trail Above Tunnel \$270,000	Alternative 8 Cut and Fill to Reroute Trail Above Tunnel \$740,000	Alternative 9 Tunnel Roof and Overburden Removal \$18,230,000
Construction and Maintenance	Construction Costs <\$4 million	-	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
	Lifespan and Durability	-	Low	Low	High	High	High	High	High	High
	Frequent & Significant Maintenance Costs	-	High	High	Low	Low	Low	Low	Low	Medium
	Vandalism/Graffiti Potential	-	High	High	High	High	Low	Low	Low	Medium
Real Estate Needs	Requires Land Acquisition	-	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Recreation	Preserves Tunnel Access and User Experience	-	Partial year	Partial year	Year-round	Year-round	Closed	Closed	Closed	NA
	Maintains Existing Trail Grade	-	Partial year	Partial year	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes
	Provides Off-Road Transportation and Recreation	-	Partial year	Partial year	Year-round	Year-round	No	Year-round	Year-round	Year-round
Endangered Plans and Animals	Preserves Bat Habitat	-	Low	High	High	Low	Medium	Medium	Medium	Eliminates
	Preserves Other Rare and Endangered Plants and Animals	-	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown
Historical Impacts	Preserves Original Tunnel Structure	-	High	High	Low	Low	High	High	Medium	Eliminates
Future Rail Use	Maintains Existing Tunnel or Improves for Rail Use	-	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Maybe	Yes
Nearby Stakeholder Impacts	Temporary or Permanent Impacts	-	Low	Low	Medium	Medium	NA	Medium	Medium	High

* Safety is not a category because all of the listed alternatives, except for Alternative 1 by itself, address the safety concerns with falling debris and provide safe access to the tunnel or a safe alternative route.

** Alternative 1 is not a stand-alone alternative because, according to page 7 of the GEI report, it would not provide safe access to the tunnel as falling debris from the ceiling would likely continue to be an issue.

*** Alternatives 2 and 3 are combined with Alternative 1 to further reduce the rate of rock deterioration for ensuring safe access to the tunnel.